



www.lsc.ohio.gov

# OHIO LEGISLATIVE SERVICE COMMISSION

Office of Research  
and Drafting

Legislative Budget  
Office

H.B. 389  
134<sup>th</sup> General Assembly

## Bill Analysis

**Version:** As Introduced

**Primary Sponsors:** Reps. Leland and Seitz

Kathleen A. Luikart, Research Analyst

### SUMMARY

#### State competitive retail electric service policy

- Amends the state policy for competitive retail electric service to include encouraging electric distribution utilities (EDUs) to develop voluntary portfolios of energy savings programs to help customers save energy.

#### Energy savings portfolio application requirements

- Permits EDUs to apply to the Public Utilities Commission (PUCO) for approval of a portfolio of programs for energy savings (energy efficiency savings and peak demand reduction savings) to help retail electric customers to save energy.
- Specifies what portfolio applications must contain about proposed energy savings programs, including for example, descriptions of program size and scope; program costs, planned energy savings, and cost-effectiveness; a mechanism for program cost recovery and utility incentives and for lost distribution revenues; and other information the EDU determines appropriate for PUCO review.

#### Application review process

- Not later than 120 days after receiving an application, requires PUCO by order to approve, or modify and approve, portfolio applications for a term not to exceed five years, if PUCO finds that the application meets the requirements under the bill.
- Allows PUCO to modify an application only as necessary for it to comply with portfolio requirements under the bill.
- Prohibits an order approving a portfolio application from authorizing accounting mechanisms under which the EDU may defer and recover costs that would exceed the \$1.50 per customer per month rate cap under the bill as described below.

- Requires an EDU to accept or withdraw its modified application not later than 90 days after the PUCO final application order, if PUCO modifies and approves the application or if a higher than expected number of customers opt out of the portfolio.

### **Additional portfolio requirements**

- Requires portfolios to include at least one program to benefit low-income residential customers with an annual income at or below 200% of the federal poverty level.
- Requires the total cost for a portfolio's proposed residential low-income customer programs to be at least 15% of the total program costs for all of the portfolio's proposed residential programs.
- Requires a portfolio to be designed to:
  - Achieve gross annual energy savings of at least 0.5% of the gross annual energy savings of the prior year's retail electric sales to participating customers except as limited by the bill's net cost provisions and establishes options for determining gross energy savings either directly or with a baseline established under federal energy standards for appliances or Ohio Building Code standards;
  - Achieve not more than 30% of the planned annual gross savings through residential programs delivering only behavioral energy savings (energy savings occurring as a result of a change in a residential retail electric customer's pattern of electricity use);
  - Emphasize smart technology measures, including ENERGY STAR® smart thermostats;
  - Only permit customer incentives on equipment that exceeds federal energy standards for appliances or Ohio Building Standards, for gross energy savings not determined through standard measurement, and verification protocols; and
  - Exclude gross energy savings from any physical device or equipment not delivered or installed with the permission or at the request of a participating customer.
- If gross annual energy savings from transmission and distribution system investments result in measurable energy efficiency savings, (1) prohibits the investments from being considered as a portfolio program for cost recovery and incentive purposes and (2) requires the energy savings to be counted toward determining whether the EDU achieved its required annual gross energy savings.

### **Utility cost test**

- Requires an EDU's approved portfolio to be cost-effective based on a utility cost test that compares the total cost of measurable portfolio programs to avoid electric generation, transmission, and distribution costs; reductions in market prices for energy and capacity; reductions in credit and collection costs; and any other quantifiable EDU system benefits.

## **Customer and EDU incentives**

- Specifies that (1) customer incentives must provide a “meaningful inducement” for customers to participate in the cost-effective delivery of energy savings and (2) EDU incentives through a portfolio must not exceed 10% of net program costs on an after-tax basis and must not count toward the portfolio’s net cost calculation under the bill.

## **Portfolio net cost limit**

- Establishes a method for calculating the net cost of an EDU’s portfolio and prohibits the net cost from exceeding 2.25% of the EDU’s annual total operating revenues for the previous year as reported in its FERC financial report, FERC Form 1, Account 400, required by the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission (FERC).
- Requires an EDU to retain 20% of revenues received from EDU incentives bid into the wholesale market and specifies that these incentives are separate from customer incentives described in the bill.
- Prohibits recovery of any lost distribution revenues under an EDU’s approved portfolio from counting toward the portfolio’s net cost.

## **Rate cap**

- Effectively caps charges for an EDU’s portfolio costs at \$1.50 per customer per month by prohibiting an EDU’s portfolio costs from resulting in a rate that produces an average monthly charge greater than that amount.
- If a higher than expected number of residential customers opt out of the portfolio, automatically authorizes an EDU with an approved portfolio to reduce portfolio spending to ensure that the EDU complies with the rate cap.

## **Customer opt-out**

- Establishes a process under which, every five years or at the start of a new portfolio, residential customers and nonresidential retail customers (customers that are not residential customers or mercantile customers) may opt out of portfolio participation and cost recovery for the portfolio.

## **Mercantile customer opt-in**

- Automatically excludes mercantile customers (commercial or industrial customers that consume more than 700,000 kilowatt hours of electricity per year or are part of a national account involving multiple facilities in one or more states) from participating in an EDU portfolio, but establishes a process under which such customers may opt in to any opportunities to participate in an EDU’s portfolio and any portfolio cost recovery.

## **EDU report**

- Requires an EDU with an approved portfolio to review the cost-effectiveness of its portfolio annually over its term, update its portfolio based on the review, and file a report of its annual review to PUCO by April 15 each year.

- Requires an EDU to continue to offer customers a portfolio of energy savings programs during its cost-effectiveness and compliance review and subject to the General Assembly’s findings regarding the EDU’s performance and compliance as described in the PUCO report required by the bill.

## **PUCO report**

- Requires PUCO, by December 31 (likely each year), to review EDU reports and submit a report to the General Assembly that includes an overview of EDU compliance and energy savings and a compilation of the EDU reports received.
- Requires PUCO to recover incremental costs of reviewing EDU reports through the affected EDU’s portfolio cost recovery mechanism and specifies that the costs must not be considered portfolio costs or included in net cost calculations under the bill.

---



---

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

State competitive retail electric service policy.....	1
Energy savings portfolio application requirements.....	1
Application review process.....	1
Additional portfolio requirements.....	2
Utility cost test.....	2
Customer and EDU incentives .....	3
Portfolio net cost limit .....	3
Rate cap .....	3
Customer opt-out .....	3
Mercantile customer opt-in.....	3
EDU report .....	3
PUCO report.....	4
State competitive retail electric service policy.....	5
Energy savings portfolios .....	5
Portfolio application requirements.....	5
Application review process.....	6
Modification restrictions and process.....	6
Additional portfolio requirements.....	7
Programs for low-income customers.....	7
Portfolio energy savings requirements.....	7
Gross energy savings determination.....	9
Energy savings from transmission and distribution system investments.....	9
Utility cost test.....	9
Customer and EDU incentives .....	9

Portfolio net cost limit .....	10
Rate cap .....	10
Customer opt-out .....	10
Mercantile customer opt-in.....	11
Cost-effectiveness and compliance review .....	11
EDU report.....	11
PUCO report .....	12

---

## DETAILED ANALYSIS

### State competitive retail electric service policy

To the state’s competitive retail electric service policy, the bill adds the new policy to “encourage electric distribution utilities to develop voluntary portfolios of energy savings programs to help their customers to save energy.”<sup>1</sup>

### Energy savings portfolios

The bill permits an electric distribution utility (EDU) to apply to the Public Utilities Commission (PUCO) for approval of a portfolio of energy savings programs for the purpose of assisting retail electric customers to achieve energy savings. Under the bill “energy savings” includes energy efficiency savings and peak demand reduction savings.<sup>2</sup>

#### Portfolio application requirements

As required by the bill, portfolio applications must include certain information about the proposed energy savings programs. Specifically, applications must include:

- Descriptions of the size and scope of the programs;
- The programs’ costs, planned energy savings, and cost-effectiveness;
- The EDU’s projection of the expected number of customers opting out of the programs under the opt-out process of the bill (see “**Customer opt-out**” below);
- The program costs, availability, and planned energy savings listed by programs for residential customer and nonresidential retail customer classes and any programs that could impact all customer classes. (Under the bill, a “nonresidential retail customer” is a customer that is not a residential customer or mercantile customer. Under the Revised Code currently, a “mercantile customer” is a commercial or industrial customer if the electricity consumed is for nonresidential use and the customer consumes more than 700,000 kilowatt hours per year or is part of a national account involving multiple

---

<sup>1</sup> R.C. 4928.02(N).

<sup>2</sup> R.C. 4928.6630 and 4928.6631.

facilities in one or more states.<sup>3</sup> Under the Ohio Administrative Code currently, a “residential customer” is a customer of a competitive retail electric service for residential purposes.<sup>4</sup>);

- A proposed mechanism for the recovery of program costs and utility incentives and for lost distribution revenues, if applicable;
- A plan to improve customers’ smart technology capability for demand side management and to improve utility control to reduce peak demand;
- A description of how the portfolio will meet the bill’s requirement to include programs to benefit low-income customers;
- If the financial parameters of the bill do not allow the portfolio design to be consistent with the energy savings measures under the bill’s net cost limitation (see “**Portfolio net cost limit**” below), a reflection and explanation of why consistency is not possible;
- Any other information the EDU determines is appropriate for PUCO review.<sup>5</sup>

## **Application review process**

Under the bill, PUCO must issue an order to approve, or modify and approve, a portfolio application not later than 120 days after receiving it, if PUCO finds that the application meets the application requirements described above and includes at least one program to benefit low-income residential customers.

Terms for approved portfolios may not exceed five years, and to replace or extend a terminating portfolio, an EDU must file a new portfolio application.

A PUCO order approving or modifying and approving an application must authorize accounting mechanisms that allow the EDU to defer and recover costs that would otherwise exceed the \$1.50 per customer per month rate cap established by the bill.<sup>6</sup> (See “**Rate cap**” below.)

## **Modification restrictions and process**

Although the bill permits PUCO to modify an application, PUCO may modify it only as necessary to bring the application into compliance with: (1) the bill’s application and portfolio design requirements, (2) the utility cost test to measure the portfolio’s cost-effectiveness, and

---

<sup>3</sup> R.C. 4928.01(A)(19), not in the bill.

<sup>4</sup> Ohio Administrative Code (O.A.C.) 4901:1-21-01(GG), not in the bill. No definition of “residential customer” exists in the Revised Code.

<sup>5</sup> R.C. 4928.6630 and 4928.6633.

<sup>6</sup> R.C. 4928.6634(A) and (C).

(3) the provisions for customer and utility incentives, portfolio net cost, and gross annual energy savings (all described below).

If PUCO modifies and approves an EDU's portfolio application, the EDU must accept the modified application or withdraw it not later than 90 days after PUCO's final order. An EDU also must accept the modified application or withdraw it within that 90-day period, if a higher than expected number of customers opt out of the portfolio.<sup>7</sup>

## **Additional portfolio requirements**

### **Programs for low-income customers**

Under the bill, an EDU's portfolio must include at least one program that benefits low-income residential customers with an annual income that is at or below 200% of the federal poverty level. And, total proposed costs for such programs must be at least 15% of the total proposed residential program costs for all residential programs in the EDU's portfolio.<sup>8</sup>

### **Portfolio energy savings requirements**

The bill requires an EDU's portfolio to achieve certain gross energy savings and specifies how to determine the savings. First, a portfolio must be designed to achieve gross annual energy savings of at least 0.5% of the gross annual energy savings of the prior year's retail electric sales to participating customers, except as limited by the bill's net cost provisions for portfolios. (See "**Portfolio net cost limit**" below.)

Second, the bill limits what annual gross energy savings certain residential programs may achieve. Under the bill, not more than 30% of the planned annual gross energy savings may be achieved through residential programs designed to deliver only behavioral energy savings. "Behavioral energy savings" is defined as "energy savings that occurs as a result of a change in a residential retail electric customer's pattern of energy use."<sup>9</sup>

For example, if a portfolio's planned energy savings is the minimum, 0.5%, then up to 0.15% of that 0.5% may be programs that deliver only behavioral savings. If a portfolio's planned energy savings is 0.75%, then up to 0.225% of that 0.75% may be behavioral savings programs. See table below for other possible scenarios.

---

<sup>7</sup> R.C. 4928.6634(A) and (B).

<sup>8</sup> R.C. 4928.6636.

<sup>9</sup> R.C. 4928.6630 and 4928.6639(A) and (B).

Possible energy savings scenarios (Energy savings x 30% limit =Total % limit for behavioral savings)	
Planned energy savings	Behavioral savings programs maximum
0.5% (minimum annual gross energy savings required under bill)	0.15 %
0.75%	0.225%
1.00%	0.30%
1.25%	0.375%
1.5%	0.45%
1.75%	0.525%
2.00%	0.6%

Third, as required by the bill, a portfolio must emphasize smart technology measures, including ENERGY STAR® qualified smart thermostats. ENERGY STAR is a “partnership program of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency and the U.S. Department of Energy that helps businesses and individuals to save energy and protect the environment through energy-efficient products, homes, and buildings.”<sup>10</sup>

Fourth, for gross energy savings determined using federal appliance standards or the Ohio Building Code (described below), a portfolio may only permit customer incentive programs for equipment that exceeds those standards.<sup>11</sup>

Fifth, portfolios must exclude gross energy savings from any physical device or equipment that has not been delivered or installed with the permission or at the request of a customer participating in the portfolio.<sup>12</sup>

<sup>10</sup> R.C. 4928.6639(C); 42 United State Code (U.S.C.) 6294a; U.S. Environmental Protection Agency and U.S. Department of Energy, “ENERGY STAR®, About ENERGY STAR,” and “Media FAQs” available at: <http://www.energystar.gov> and <https://www.energystar.gov/about/newsroom/media-faqs> accessed on September 15, 2021.

<sup>11</sup> R.C. 4928.6639(E).

<sup>12</sup> R.C. 4928.6639(F).



## Gross energy savings determination

Under the bill, a portfolio's gross energy savings must be determined (1) directly through standard evaluation, measurement, and verification protocols, such as a bill savings analysis or (2) for savings not determined through these protocols, with a baseline established for [federal energy standards for appliances and other equipment](#)<sup>13</sup> or standards under the Ohio Building Code.<sup>14</sup>

## Energy savings from transmission and distribution system investments

If gross annual energy savings from transmission and distribution system investments result in measurable energy efficiency savings, the bill requires the following:

- The investments must not be considered as a portfolio program for cost recovery and incentive purposes under the portfolio;
- The energy savings must count toward determining whether the EDU achieved its required annual gross energy savings of at least 0.5% as described above.<sup>15</sup>

## Utility cost test

The bill requires an approved portfolio to be cost-effective based on a utility cost test. As specified in the bill, the cost-effectiveness of a portfolio is determined by comparing the total cost of its measurable programs to any of the following:

- Avoided electric generation, transmission, and distribution costs;
- Reductions in market prices for energy and capacity;
- Reductions in EDU credit and collection costs;
- Any other quantifiable EDU system benefits.<sup>16</sup>

## Customer and EDU incentives

Customer incentives that an EDU offers through a portfolio must provide, under the bill, "a meaningful inducement for customers to participate in the cost-effective delivery of projected energy savings." The bill does not define what constitutes a "meaningful inducement" nor does it set up any other requirements for a portfolio's customer incentive programs.

---

<sup>13</sup> 42 U.S.C. 6295; U.S. Department of Energy, Office of Energy Efficiency & Renewable Energy, "Standards and Test Procedures," available at: <https://www.energy.gov/eere/buildings/standards-and-test-procedures>, accessed on September 14, 2021.

<sup>14</sup> R.C. 4928.6639(D); R.C. Chapter 3781, not in the bill.

<sup>15</sup> R.C. 4928.6653.

<sup>16</sup> R.C. 4928.6641.

Utility incentives through a portfolio must not exceed 10% of net program costs on an after-tax basis and must not count toward the net cost of the portfolio. (See “**Portfolio net cost limit**” below).<sup>17</sup> The bill does not create a definition, or establish any other requirements, for “utility incentives.”

### **Portfolio net cost limit**

The bill limits the net cost of an EDU’s portfolio. “Net cost” equals an EDU’s total program costs for an approved portfolio minus 80% of any revenue the EDU collects during the same program year from capacity, environmental, and other attributes of the EDU’s energy savings programs, including bidding efficiency into the wholesale market operated by PJM Interconnection L.L.C.

Under the bill, an EDU’s net cost must not exceed 2.25% of the EDU’s annual total electric operating revenues for the previous year as reported in its FERC financial report, FERC Form 1, Account 400. FERC Form 1, is the annual report required by the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission (FERC) for the purpose of collecting financial and operational information from major electric utilities, licensees, and others subject to FERC.

The EDU must retain 20% of revenues received from utility incentives that are bid into the wholesale market, which incentives must be separate from customer incentives offered through a portfolio under the bill.<sup>18</sup>

If there are any lost distribution revenues under an EDU’s portfolio, the recovery of that lost revenue does not count toward the net cost of the portfolio.<sup>19</sup>

### **Rate cap**

The bill prohibits an EDU’s portfolio costs from resulting in a residential customer rate that produces an average monthly charge that is greater than \$1.50 per customer per month. To ensure that the EDU complies with the rate cap, an EDU with an approved portfolio automatically is authorized to reduce portfolio spending, if a higher than expected number of residential customers opt out of the portfolio. See “**Customer opt-out**” below.<sup>20</sup>

### **Customer opt-out**

The bill provides an opportunity for residential customers and nonresidential retail customers to opt out of portfolio participation and cost recovery for the portfolio. The opt-out opportunity must be offered by an EDU with a PUCO-approved portfolio every five years or at the start of a new portfolio. Within five business days after its portfolio is approved, the EDU must send, to all residential customers and nonresidential retail customers in its certified

---

<sup>17</sup> R.C. 4928.6644.

<sup>18</sup> R.C. 4928.6647; 18 Code of Federal Regulations 141.1.

<sup>19</sup> R.C. 4928.6646.

<sup>20</sup> R.C. 4928.6650.

territory, written notice describing the opt-out option. The time period during which a customer may opt out of participation must extend at least 21 days from the date of the postmark on the written notice. A customer is deemed to have opted out, if the customer, as the EDU prescribes, indicates the intent to opt out with a return postcard or notice that is postmarked or submitted by other means before the deadline has elapsed.<sup>21</sup>

## **Mercantile customer opt-in**

Unless they choose to opt in to an EDU's portfolio, mercantile customers are not included in the portfolio. Under the bill, they are automatically opted out of any opportunities to participate in an EDU's portfolio and any portfolio cost recovery.

The opt-in process requires an EDU to send, to all mercantile customers in its certified territory, a written notice describing the option to opt in to portfolio participation. If a mercantile customer indicates its intent to opt in, the customer is deemed to have opted in, if the customer does so as prescribed by the EDU. Mercantile customers that opt in remain as an opt-in customer for a period of at least one year from the date the customer first receives the "benefit of participation."<sup>22</sup>

The bill does not describe what is considered to be a benefit of participation or how to determine the date when the benefit is first received. Presumably, the benefit of participation is lower energy costs due to portfolio participation and the date a customer first receives the benefit might be determined based on the date of the first billing with a lower energy bill.

## **Cost-effectiveness and compliance review**

### **EDU report**

Over its term, an EDU's approved portfolio is subject to an annual cost-effectiveness and compliance review under the bill. Each year the EDU must review the cost-effectiveness of its portfolio according to the utility cost test and inputs that the bill establishes and must file a report of its review with PUCO by April 15. Based on the review, the EDU may update its portfolio as needed.<sup>23</sup>

The bill requires an EDU to continue to offer customers a portfolio of energy savings programs during the review required under the bill's reporting provisions and subject to the findings of the General Assembly regarding the EDU's performance and compliance as described in the PUCO's report.<sup>24</sup> The bill does not expressly state whether the phrase "during review under this section" refers to the EDU's review, the PUCO review of the EDU's report to PUCO, or both. Both an EDU and PUCO must conduct reviews under Revised Code Section 4928.6660 of the bill, but it is likely that the programs would continue to be offered until the

---

<sup>21</sup> R.C. 4928.6657.

<sup>22</sup> R.C. 4928.6655.

<sup>23</sup> R.C. 4928.60(A) and (B).

<sup>24</sup> R.C. 4928.6660(E).

portfolio's term ends unless the General Assembly or PUCO took action to discontinue programs for costliness or noncompliance with the law.

### **PUCO report**

The bill requires PUCO, by December 31, to review each EDU cost-effectiveness and compliance report and submit a report to the General Assembly that includes a compilation of EDU reports received and an overview of EDU compliance and energy savings. Although not expressly stated in the bill, PUCO would likely have to submit the report by December 31 *each year*.

Based on the results of the PUCO's review of an EDU's report, the bill requires the PUCO's incremental costs of each review process and the EDU's incentives to be recovered through the affected EDU's portfolio's cost recovery mechanism. PUCO's review costs and the EDU's incentives must not be considered as portfolio costs or included in the net cost calculations required under the bill. (See "**Portfolio net cost limit**" above.)<sup>25</sup>

---

## **HISTORY**

Action	Date
Introduced	08-12-21

---

H0389-I-134/ts

---

<sup>25</sup> R.C. 4928.6660(C) and (D).