## Ohio Legislative Service Commission

Office of Research and Drafting

Legislative Budget
Office

Version: As Introduced
Primary Sponsors: Reps. Ray and Brent
Local Impact Statement Procedure Required: Yes
Michael Kerr, Budget Analyst

## Highlights

- The bill authorizes a $\$ 750$ nonrefundable tax credit per dwelling, with a limit of $\$ 7,500$ per year, for landlords that agree not to charge additional rent or fees for tenants with companion animals, defined as a dog or cat, and to forgo any size or breed restrictions on companion animals allowed to reside on their property.
- Under the bill, the credit may be claimed against either the commercial activity tax (CAT), the personal income tax (PIT), or the financial institutions tax (FIT).
- The total cost of the credit under the bill is estimated to be between $\$ 160$ million and $\$ 255$ million a year, however, this estimate should be considered unavoidably rough. LBO assumes an effective date of tax year (TY) 2024, and a reduction in GRF receipts beginning in FY 2025.
- The CAT, PIT, and FIT are GRF tax sources, so the revenue losses would be shared among the GRF (96.60\%), Local Government Fund (LGF, 1.70\%), and Public Library Fund (PLF, 1.70\%).


## Detailed Analysis

The bill provides a $\$ 750$ nonrefundable tax credit per dwelling for landlords that agree not to charge additional rent or fees for tenants with companion animals, defined as a dog or cat, and to forgo any size or breed restrictions on companion animals allowed to reside on their property for the entire taxable year in which the credit is claimed. The bill makes an exception that permits the landlord to prohibit a companion animal that has been adjudicated to be a dangerous or vicious dog. The total credit claimed by a taxpayer cannot exceed $\$ 7,500$. The credit would apply against either the commercial activity tax (CAT), the personal income tax (PIT), or the financial institutions tax (FIT).

## Landlord investors

There are an estimated 700,000 rental properties owned by individuals or other entities across the state of Ohio, accounting for approximately 1.7 million rental units, occupied or unoccupied. See Table 1 below for additional details.

| Table 1. Number of Rental Properties and Units by Ownership Entity |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Ownership Entity | Number of Rental Properties |  | Number of Rental Units |  |
|  | U.S. | Ohio** | U.S. | Ohio** |
| Individual Investor | $13,421,000$ | 469,735 | $18,389,000$ | 643,615 |
| LLP, LP, or LLC | $3,065,000$ | 107,275 | $20,222,000$ | 707,770 |
| Trustee for Estate | 488,000 | 17,080 | 979,000 | 34,265 |
| Tenant in Common | 424,000 | 14,840 | 511,000 | 17,885 |
| Nonprofit Organization | 367,000 | 12,845 | $1,307,000$ | 45,745 |
| Other* | $1,577,000$ | 55,195 | $8,139,000$ | 284,865 |
|  | $\mathbf{1 9 , 3 4 2 , 0 0 0}$ | $\mathbf{6 7 6 , 9 7 0}$ | $\mathbf{4 9 , 5 4 7 , 0 0 0}$ | $\mathbf{1 , 7 3 4 , 1 4 5}$ |

Source: U.S. Census Bureau's 2021 Rental Housing Finance Survey (RHFS) for all properties and units nationwide.
*"Other" category includes General Partnerships, Real Estate Investment Trusts (REITs), Real Estate Corporations, Housing Cooperative Organizations, etc.
**Ohio figures were calculated proportionally based on the ratio of Ohio's population to the nation, which is roughly $3.5 \%$.

## Rental housing units

Ohio is estimated to have around 4.8 million occupied housing units, over 1.5 million of which are renter-occupied. ${ }^{1}$ The total number of these renter-occupied units that are part of a property with ten or more units is approximately 400,000 , or around $26 \%$ of all renter-occupied units in the state. ${ }^{2}$ This percentage is also higher for some cities; in Cleveland, for example, $34 \%$ of all renters are estimated to live on a property with ten or more units. No more than ten units in these larger properties would qualify for the tax credit under the bill. All of the roughly 1.1 million units in structures with less than ten units would qualify. For the rest, the following assumptions were made: $50 \%$ of the units in structures with ten to 19 units, $30 \%$ of the units in structures with 20 to 49 units, and $5 \%$ of the units in structures with 50 or more units were counted as qualifying units. This method leaves roughly 1.2 million units across the state eligible. See Table 2 below for additional details.

[^0]| Table 2. Number of Renter-occupied Units <br> by the Number of Units on a Property |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Units in Structure | City of Cleveland <br> (Units) | State of Ohio <br> (Units) |
| 1, detached | 100,200 | 517,100 |
| 1, attached | 13,700 | 74,600 |
| 2 to 4 | 46,700 | 285,800 |
| 5 to 9 | 30,800 | 199,600 |
| 10 to 19 | 28,100 | 145,800 |
| 20 to 49 | 19,000 | 123,500 |
| 50 or more | 50,200 | 131,500 |
| Other* | $\mathbf{2 8 9 0}$ | 43,300 |

Source: U.S. Census Bureau's 2019 American Housing Survey (AHS) for Ohio and Cleveland.
*"Other" category includes manufactured/mobile homes, boats, recreational vehicles, etc.

## Pet ownership

Out of an estimated 1.5 million renter-occupied housing units in Ohio, LBO estimates that roughly 370,000 have at least one dog in their household, and around 300,000 have at least one cat, according to the 2021 U.S. Census Bureau's American Housing Survey (AHS). Close to 600,000 renter-occupied units in Ohio appear have at least one pet, including other types of pets apart from dogs and cats. Since the figures provided for dogs and cats are not necessarily mutually exclusive, i.e., households can have both a cat and a dog, and the upper limit (i.e., 600,000) on the number of units having any type of pet listed on the survey is known, it is estimated that between $25 \%$ and $40 \%$ of renter-occupied housing units in the state have at least one dog or cat. See Table 3 below for additional details.

| Table 3. Total Number of Renter-occupied Households with Pets |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Presence of Pets <br> in Household | East North Central Division <br> (Units) | Ohio (Units)** |
| At least one dog | $1,482,000$ | 370,500 |
| At least one cat | $1,204,000$ | 301,000 |
| No pets*** | $3,362,000$ | 840,500 |


| Table 3. Total Number of Renter-occupied Households with Pets |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Presence of Pets <br> in Household | East North Central Division <br> (Units) | Ohio (Units)** |
| At least one pet*** | $2,383,000$ | 595,750 |
| Total Renter-occupied Units* | $\mathbf{6 , 0 6 0 , 0 0 0 *}$ | $\mathbf{1 , 5 1 5 , 0 0 0 ^ { * }}$ |

Source: U.S. Census Bureau's 2021 American Housing Survey (AHS) for Household Pets.
*Figures do not add to totals because more than one category may apply to each unit, i.e., a household may have a dog and a cat. Listed totals represent the total estimated number of renter-occupied units in the East North Central Census Division (ENCD) and the state of Ohio.
**Ohio's figures were calculated from the ENCD proportionally based upon population; Ohio represents roughly $25 \%$ of the ENCD.
***Other types of pets, including fish, birds, reptiles, and small mammals were excluded from this table; however, the categories of "No pets" and "At least one pet" consider animals other than just dogs and cats to be pets for the purpose of their calculation.

## Prohibition on animal breed \& size restrictions

The bill prohibits landlords that claim the tax credit from imposing any restrictions on the size or breed of a dog or cat allowed to reside on their property. This requirement extends beyond the maximum of ten dwelling units upon which credits are able to be claimed to the landlord's entire residential premises. The only exception to this requirement is when a companion animal has already been determined to be a dangerous or vicious dog under the Revised Code.

It is unknown how many landlords across the state currently allow companion animals on their property and the number imposing breed or size restrictions.

## Credit applicability

The CAT and FIT have a more narrow scope of taxpayers than the PIT. Most Ohio landlords owning qualifying rental units, who can apply the credit against their state tax liability, are expected to claim the credit against the PIT.

The commercial activity tax is a business privilege tax measured by taxable gross receipts, paid by individuals and entities having more than $\$ 150,000$ of such receipts in a calendar year (CY). ${ }^{3}$ However, beginning in CY 2024, only those with taxable gross receipts in excess of $\$ 3$ million will be subject to the CAT, and $\$ 6$ million in CY 2025 and thereafter. Taxable gross receipts in excess of the exclusion amount are subject to the $0.26 \%$ tax rate.

The financial institutions tax is levied as a business privilege tax on financial institutions, measured by the total equity capital of the financial institution apportioned to Ohio. The apportionment factor includes a calculation of the total gross receipts of the financial institution in a calendar year.

The personal income tax is levied on statutorily defined incomes of every individual, trust, and estate residing in Ohio or earning or receiving income in Ohio, or otherwise having nexus with or in Ohio. However, the business income deduction (BID) allows taxpayers to deduct the

[^1]first $\$ 250,000$ ( $\$ 125,000$ for married filing separate) of their business income included in their federal adjusted gross income. Determining if rental payments qualify as business income is considered dependent on the specific facts and circumstances of a taxpayer's claim. If an individual is considered to be in the trade or business of rental property, however, such as actively advertising, managing, or maintaining a rental property, the income would likely be considered business income.

## Estimated taxable income sources for landlords

As mentioned, Ohio excludes the first $\$ 250,000$ of business income from taxation, and rental income is generally considered a business income source. The credit authorized by the bill could offset tax due for all sources of nonbusiness income as well as business income in excess of $\$ 250,000$. The table below categorizes the estimated state tax liability for those persons reporting rental income to the Current Population Survey (CPS), 2023 Annual Social and Economic (ASEC) Supplement, which is conducted by the U.S. Census Bureau. As seen in Table 4, nearly 30\% of those persons reporting rental income would not owe any state tax, if the national population is representative of Ohio landlords. Consequently, the nonrefundable credit authorized by the bill is unlikely to be fully utilized by eligible taxpayers.

| Table 4. Estimated TY 2024 PIT Liability <br> Among Persons with Rental Income |  |
| :--- | :---: |
| Estimated State Income Tax <br> Due Before All Credits | Percentage of Total Persons <br> Reporting Rental Income |
| None | $29.1 \%$ |
| $\$ 750$ or less | $6.1 \%$ |
| $\$ 751$ to \$1,500 | $13.0 \%$ |
| $\$ 1,501$ to $\$ 2,250$ | $10.1 \%$ |
| $\$ 2,251$ to $\$ 3,000$ | $8.1 \%$ |
| $\$ 3,001$ to $\$ 3,750$ | $5.1 \%$ |
| $\$ 3,751$ to $\$ 7,500$ | $15.1 \%$ |
| More than $\$ 7,500$ | $13.5 \%$ |
|  | $100.0 \%$ |

Note: LBO tabulation of income sources reported in CPS 2023 ASEC Supplement. Applies TY 2024 Ohio personal income tax rates on taxable income of all nationwide respondents.

## Fiscal effect

If each property owner of an eligible rental housing unit was able to claim the $\$ 750$ credit per dwelling, the total estimated cost would be between $\$ 225$ million and $\$ 360$ million a year.

However, slightly above $29 \%$ of landlords are unlikely to owe any state tax. As a result, LBO estimates that the total cost of the credit under the bill would be closer to between $\$ 160$ million and $\$ 255$ million a year. However, given the nature of these data and the extensive assumptions made, this estimate should be considered unavoidably rough.

This analysis assumes, for instance: that pet owners are equally likely to live in any housing unit regardless of the number of units in the structure, that all landlords with eligible rental units and state income tax liability are able to claim each credit (i.e., have not reached the ten-unit maximum), that the credit is equally likely to be claimed by a landlord for an eligible housing unit regardless of the number of units on the landlord's property or the amount of the landlord's nonzero state income tax liability, and that the number of renters with pets remains unchanged following implementation of the credit.

The revenue loss would be shared by the GRF (receiving 96.60\% through FY 2025, 96.68\% in subsequent years) and the Local Government (LGF, Fund 7069) and Public Library (PLF, Fund 7065) funds (both receiving 1.70\% through FY 2025, 1.66\% in subsequent years). Funds deposited into the LGF and PLF are distributed to counties, municipalities, townships, and public libraries according to statutory formulas and decisions by county budget commissions.


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ U.S. Census Bureau's 2021 American Community Survey (ACS).
    ${ }^{2}$ U.S. Census Bureau's 2019 American Housing Survey (AHS).

[^1]:    ${ }^{3}$ Recently enacted changes to the CAT are summarized on the Ohio Department of Taxation's website: tax.ohio.gov.

