



# Ohio Legislative Service Commission

## Bill Analysis

Brian D. Malachowsky

### H.B. 69

131st General Assembly  
(As Introduced)

**Reps.** Hagan and Hood, Rosenberger, Buchy, Amstutz, Antani, Becker, Blessing, Boose, Brenner, Brinkman, Burkley, Butler, Conditt, Derickson, DeVitis, Dovilla, Ginter, Hall, Hambley, Hayes, Henne, Hill, Huffman, T. Johnson, Koehler, Kraus, Landis, LaTourette, Maag, McClain, McColley, Patmon, Pelanda, Perales, Retherford, Rezabek, Roegner, Romanchuk, Ruhl, Schaffer, Schuring, Slaby, R. Smith, Sprague, Terhar, Thompson, Vitale, Young, Zeltwanger

---

## BILL SUMMARY

### Abortion prohibited when there is a fetal heartbeat

- Generally prohibits a person from knowingly and purposefully performing or inducing an abortion with the specific intent of causing or abetting the termination of the life of an unborn human individual whose fetal heartbeat has been detected.
- Provides that a person who violates the above prohibition is guilty of performing or inducing an abortion after the detection of a fetal heartbeat, a felony of the fifth degree.
- Provides that a physician is not in violation of the above prohibition if that physician performs a medical procedure designed to or intended to prevent the death of a pregnant woman or prevent a serious risk of substantial and irreversible impairment of a major bodily function of the pregnant woman.
- Provides that a person is not in violation of the prohibition if that person has performed an examination for the presence of a fetal heartbeat and the method used does not reveal a fetal heartbeat.
- Provides that the prohibition does not repeal or limit any other provision of law that restricts or regulates the performance or inducement of an abortion by a particular method or during a particular stage of pregnancy.

## **Offense of abortion before determining fetal heart beat**

- Provides that a person who knowingly and purposefully performs or induces an abortion before determining if there is a fetal heartbeat is guilty of performing or inducing abortion before determining whether there is a detectable fetal heartbeat, a felony of the fifth degree.
- Provides that a physician does not commit the offense if the physician performs or induces an abortion believing that a medical emergency exists.
- Provides that a person does not commit the offense if that person has performed an examination for the presence of a fetal heartbeat and the method used does not reveal a fetal heartbeat.

## **Wrongful death actions**

- Requires a woman to be awarded court costs and reasonable attorney's fees if she prevails in a civil action for the wrongful death of her unborn child.
- Provides that a determination of unconstitutionality is a defense, if the suit is based on a provision that was deemed unconstitutional.
- Requires that a defendant be awarded reasonable attorney fees if the action was frivolous and the defendant was adversely affected.

## **Adoption promotion and support**

- States that it is the General Assembly's intent that women whose pregnancies are protected under the bill be informed of available options for adoption.
- Creates the Joint Legislative Committee on Adoption Promotion and Support, comprised of three House of Representative members and three Senate members, to further the General Assembly's intent described above.
- Permits the Committee to review or study any matter that it considers relevant to the adoption process in Ohio and grants the Committee the same powers as other standing or select committees of the General Assembly.

## **Declaratory judgments and court orders**

- Permits the Attorney General to apply to a state or federal court for a declaration that the bill's provisions are constitutional, or an order lifting an injunction if one exists, if federal abortion law changes.



- Permits a county prosecutor to apply to a state or federal court for the above relief if the Attorney General fails to act within 30 days of the change.

## Other provisions

- Requires the Department of Health to inspect the medical records of a facility that performs abortions to ensure compliance with certain reporting requirements.
- Requires a person to fulfill certain documentation requirements when the person performs an abortion relating to the bill's provisions.
- Provides that nothing in the bill prohibits the sale, use, prescription, or administration of a drug, device, or chemical that is designed for contraceptive purposes.

---

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abortion prohibited when there is a fetal heartbeat .....	4
Exceptions to prohibition .....	4
(1) Medical procedures to prevent a woman's death or bodily impairment .....	4
(2) No fetal heartbeat revealed .....	5
Abortions performed to preserve a woman's health .....	5
Additional documentation requirement .....	5
Relationship to other abortion laws .....	6
Acknowledgement by pregnant woman .....	6
Abortion before determining fetal heartbeat .....	6
Exceptions .....	7
(1) Medical emergency .....	7
(2) No fetal heartbeat revealed .....	7
No prohibitions regarding contraception .....	7
Findings by the General Assembly .....	7
Applicability of the bill .....	8
Severability .....	8
Medical record inspection .....	9
Reporting requirement .....	9
Disciplinary action .....	10
Declaratory judgments and court orders .....	10
Wrongful death action .....	11
Circumstances supporting action .....	11
Recovery of court costs and attorney's fees .....	12
Unconstitutionality defense .....	12
Pregnant woman not liable .....	12
Intent of General Assembly regarding adoption information .....	13
Joint Legislative Committee on Adoption Promotion and Support .....	13
Committee membership .....	13
Terms of office .....	13
Filling of vacancies .....	14
Background: current Ohio law regarding abortion .....	14



Determination of fetal heartbeat before an abortion.....	14
Abortion procedure in case of fetal heartbeat .....	14

---

## **CONTENT AND OPERATION**

### **Abortion prohibited when there is a fetal heartbeat**

The bill generally prohibits a person from knowingly and purposefully performing or inducing an abortion on a pregnant woman with the specific intent of causing or abetting the termination of the life of the unborn human individual that the pregnant woman is carrying and whose fetal heartbeat has been detected in accordance with the requirements of the bill. Whoever violates this prohibition is guilty of performing or inducing an abortion after the detection of a fetal heartbeat, a felony of the fifth degree.<sup>1</sup>

#### **Exceptions to prohibition**

As described below, there are two circumstances in which a person is not in violation of the prohibition against performing or inducing an abortion when there is a fetal heartbeat.

##### **(1) Medical procedures to prevent a woman's death or bodily impairment**

A physician who performs a medical procedure designed or intended, in that physician's reasonable medical judgment, to prevent the death of a pregnant woman or to prevent a serious risk of the substantial and irreversible impairment of a major bodily function of the pregnant woman is not in violation of the prohibition.<sup>2</sup> Continuing law defines a "serious risk of the substantial and irreversible impairment of a major bodily function" as any medically diagnosed condition that so complicates the pregnancy of the woman as to directly or indirectly cause the substantial and irreversible impairment of a major bodily function. A medically diagnosed condition that constitutes a "serious risk of the substantial and irreversible impairment of a major bodily function" includes pre-eclampsia, inevitable abortion, and premature rupture of the membranes, may include, but is not limited to, diabetes and multiple sclerosis, and does not include a condition related to the woman's mental health.<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> R.C. 2919.195(A).

<sup>2</sup> R.C. 2919.195(B).

<sup>3</sup> R.C. 2919.19(A)(12); R.C. 2919.16(K), not in the bill.



A physician in this circumstance must declare in writing that the medical procedure is necessary, to the best of that physician's reasonable medical judgment, to prevent the death of the pregnant woman or to prevent a serious risk of the substantial and irreversible impairment of a major bodily function of the pregnant woman. The physician must also provide in the written document, the medical condition that the procedure will assertedly address, and the medical rationale for the conclusion that the procedure is necessary. The physician must place the written documentation in the pregnant woman's medical records and maintain a copy of the written documentation in the physician's own records for at least seven years.<sup>4</sup>

## **(2) No fetal heartbeat revealed**

A person who has performed an examination for the presence of a fetal heartbeat, in accordance with the person's good-faith understanding of standard medical practice, that does not reveal a fetal heartbeat, is not in violation of the prohibition.<sup>5</sup>

## **Abortions performed to preserve a woman's health**

### **Additional documentation requirement**

After a fetal heartbeat has been detected pursuant to the bill's requirements, any person performing or inducing an abortion for the purpose of *preserving the health* of the pregnant woman is required by the bill to set forth in a written document the medical condition that the abortion will address and the medical rationale for the conclusion that the abortion is necessary to address the condition.<sup>6</sup> If the abortion is not to preserve the health of the pregnant woman, the person performing or inducing the abortion must specify in a written document that the purpose was not maternal health.<sup>7</sup> The person must place either written document in the pregnant woman's medical records and maintain a copy in the person's own records for at least seven years.<sup>8</sup> This documentation requirement appears to be independent of the documentation requirements discussed above relative to medical procedures performed to prevent a woman's death or bodily impairment.<sup>9</sup>

---

<sup>4</sup> R.C. 2919.195(B).

<sup>5</sup> R.C. 2919.192(A) and 2919.195(C).

<sup>6</sup> R.C. 2919.196(A)(1).

<sup>7</sup> R.C. 2919.196(A)(2).

<sup>8</sup> R.C. 2919.196(B).

<sup>9</sup> R.C. 2919.195 and 2919.196.

Although the bill refers to the performance of an abortion to preserve a pregnant woman's health, the bill does not contain an express exception that would authorize an abortion to be performed for this purpose after a fetal heartbeat has been detected.

### **Relationship to other abortion laws**

The prohibition against knowingly and purposefully performing or inducing an abortion when there is a fetal heartbeat does not repeal or limit any other provision of the Revised Code that restricts or regulates the performance or inducement of an abortion by a particular method or during a particular state of a pregnancy.<sup>10</sup> Under continuing law, "pregnancy" is defined as the human female reproductive condition that begins with fertilization, when the woman is carrying the developing human offspring, and that is calculated from the first day of the last menstrual period of the woman.<sup>11</sup>

### **Acknowledgement by pregnant woman**

If the person who intends to perform or induce an abortion on a pregnant woman detects a fetal heartbeat in the unborn human individual that the pregnant woman is carrying, the pregnant woman must sign a form acknowledging that the pregnant woman has received information from the person intending to perform or induce the abortion that the unborn human individual that the pregnant woman is carrying has a fetal heartbeat and that the pregnant woman is aware of the statistical probability of bringing the unborn human individual that the pregnant woman is carrying to term. The acknowledgement form must be signed at least 24 hours prior to performance or inducement of the intended abortion. Continuing law requires the person to notify the pregnant woman of the existence of a fetal heartbeat and the statistical probability of the unborn human individual being brought to term.<sup>12</sup>

### **Abortion before determining fetal heartbeat**

The bill provides that, except when prevented by a medical emergency in certain cases, whoever knowingly and purposefully performs or induces an abortion without determining whether there is a detectable fetal heartbeat is guilty of a felony of the fifth degree. Continuing law prohibits this already, but only provides for a civil action for

---

<sup>10</sup> R.C. 2919.195(D).

<sup>11</sup> R.C. 2919.19(A)(11).

<sup>12</sup> R.C. 2919.194(A)(1) to (3).

compensatory and exemplary damages or disciplinary action by the State Medical Board for a violation.<sup>13</sup>

## **Exceptions**

### **(1) Medical emergency**

Under the bill, if a medical emergency prevents a physician from determining the presence of a fetal heartbeat, the physician must note the belief that the medical emergency necessitated the abortion and the medical condition that caused the emergency. The physician must maintain this record for at least seven years. Current law provides for the same exception and notation requirements, but applies them broadly to "any person" not just physicians.<sup>14</sup>

### **(2) No fetal heartbeat revealed**

In addition, a person who has performed an examination for the presence of a fetal heartbeat, in accordance with the person's good faith understanding of standard medical practice, that does not reveal a fetal heartbeat, does not commit the offense.<sup>15</sup>

## **No prohibitions regarding contraception**

Nothing in the bill prohibits the sale, use, prescription, or administration of a drug, device, or chemical designed for contraceptive purposes.<sup>16</sup> "Contraceptive" means a drug, device, or chemical that prevents conception and "conception" means fertilization.<sup>17</sup>

## **Findings by the General Assembly**

Under the bill, the General Assembly declares that it finds, according to contemporary medical research, all of the following:<sup>18</sup>

(1) As many as 30% of natural pregnancies end in spontaneous miscarriage (defined as the natural or accidental termination of a pregnancy and the expulsion of

---

<sup>13</sup> R.C. 2919.193(A) and 4731.22(B)(47).

<sup>14</sup> R.C. 2919.193(C).

<sup>15</sup> R.C. 2919.193(D).

<sup>16</sup> R.C. 2919.197.

<sup>17</sup> R.C. 2919.19(A)(1) and (2).

<sup>18</sup> R.C. 2919.191(A).



the fetus, typically because of fetal genetic defects or physical abnormalities in the woman);<sup>19</sup>

(2) Less than 5% of all natural pregnancies end in spontaneous miscarriage after detection of fetal cardiac activity;

(3) Over 90% of in vitro pregnancies survive the first trimester if cardiac activity is detected in the gestational sac;

(4) Nearly 90% of in vitro pregnancies do not survive the first trimester where cardiac activity is not detected in the gestational sac;

(5) Fetal heartbeat, therefore, has become a key medical predictor that an unborn human individual will reach live birth;

(6) Cardiac activity begins at a biologically identifiable moment in time, normally when the fetal heart is formed in the gestational sac;

(7) The State of Ohio has legitimate interests from the outset of the pregnancy in protecting the health of the woman and the life of the unborn human individual who may be born;

(8) In order to make an informed choice about whether to continue her pregnancy, the pregnant woman has a legitimate interest in knowing the likelihood of the fetus surviving to full-term birth based upon the presence of cardiac activity.

### **Applicability of the bill**

The bill states that provisions in existing law and the bill prohibiting abortion before and after detection of a fetal heartbeat apply only to intrauterine pregnancies.<sup>20</sup> "Intrauterine pregnancy" is defined to mean a pregnancy in which the fetus is attached to the placenta within the uterus of the pregnant woman.<sup>21</sup>

### **Severability**

The bill provides that if any provision of R.C. 2919.171 or 2919.19 to 2919.1910 or their application to any person or circumstance is held invalid, the invalidity does not affect other provisions or applications of those sections that can be given effect without

---

<sup>19</sup> R.C. 2919.19(A)(13).

<sup>20</sup> R.C. 2919.191(B).

<sup>21</sup> R.C. 2919.19(A)(8).



the invalid provision or application, and to this end those provisions are severable. Moreover, the bill expresses that the General Assembly's intent is to continue the immediate and continuing enforcement of the remainder of the provisions in those sections, should any individual provision of those sections be held invalid or if any provision is potentially invalid.<sup>22</sup> The General Assembly also intends a court judgment or order suspending any provision of those sections not to be regarded as tantamount to a repeal of that provision.<sup>23</sup> Finally, nothing in R.C. 2919.171 or 2919.191 to 2919.1910 is intended to repeal or limit any other Ohio laws, except as provided in those sections.<sup>24</sup>

### **Medical record inspection**

The bill requires the Department of Health to inspect medical records from any facility that performs abortions. The inspection is to ensure that physicians and other persons who perform abortions at that facility comply with the reporting requirement described below. The bill requires the facility to make the medical records available for inspection, but prohibits releasing any personal medical information that is prohibited by law.<sup>25</sup>

### **Reporting requirement**

The bill requires a physician who performs or induces abortions, in addition to the reports to the Department of Health required under continuing law relating to written certifications and determinations regarding viability, to also provide all of the information the physician is required to certify in writing or determine with respect to abortions and the provisions of existing law and the bill relating to fetal heartbeat detection. The bill provides that if a person other than the physician described above makes or maintains records relating to abortions and fetal heartbeat detection on the physician's behalf or at the physician's direction, that person must comply with the reporting requirements.<sup>26</sup>

---

<sup>22</sup> R.C. 2919.19(B)(4).

<sup>23</sup> R.C. 2919.19(B)(1).

<sup>24</sup> R.C. 2919.19(B)(4).

<sup>25</sup> R.C. 2919.1911.

<sup>26</sup> R.C. 2919.171(A)

## Disciplinary action

The bill permits the State Medical Board to take disciplinary action for failure to comply with the requirements to make or maintain the following medical records or documents for a pregnant woman regarding an abortion procedure:

- Fetal heartbeat determination test results, date and time of test, test method used, and gestational age;
- Notations of the physician's belief regarding the medical emergency and the woman's medical condition preventing compliance with the requirement to determine the presence of a fetal heartbeat;
- Written declaration that the abortion is necessary to prevent the death of, or serious risk of substantial and irreversible impairment of a major bodily function of, the pregnant woman, in situations in which a fetal heartbeat is present;
- Written documentation regarding medical condition and medical rationale, in situations in which the abortion is purportedly to preserve the pregnant woman's health;
- Written documentation that maternal health is not the purpose of the abortion, in situations in which the abortion is other than to preserve the pregnant woman's health.

Current law permits disciplinary action for (1) failure to comply with the requirements for maintaining notes in the medical records of the emergency necessitating the abortion prior to detecting a fetal heartbeat and the medical condition of the woman that required the abortion, and (2) failure to satisfy all the requirements under law regarding determining the presence of fetal heartbeat prior to performing or inducing an abortion. Disciplinary action permitted under current law includes revoking or suspending an individual's certificate to practice or reprimanding or placing a certificate holder on probation.<sup>27</sup>

## Declaratory judgments and court orders

The bill permits the Attorney General to take certain legal action if the U.S. Supreme Court overrules *Roe v. Wade*,<sup>28</sup> any other court issues an order or judgment

---

<sup>27</sup> R.C. 2919.192(A), 2919.193(C), 2919.195(B), 2919.196(A), and 4731.22(B)(47).

<sup>28</sup> 410 U.S. 113 (1973).

restoring, expanding, or clarifying the authority of states to prohibit or regulate abortion entirely or in part, or the federal Constitution is amended to restore, expand, or clarify the authority of states to prohibit or regulate abortion entirely or in part.<sup>29</sup> The bill permits the Attorney General to seek either or both of the following from a federal or state court:

(1) A declaration that any of the bill's provisions are constitutional (see **COMMENT 2**);

(2) A judgment or order lifting an injunction if one has been placed on provisions contained in the bill.

The bill permits any county prosecutor to apply to a state or federal court for the same relief if the Attorney General fails to act within 30 days of the change.<sup>30</sup>

## **Wrongful death action**

### **Circumstances supporting action**

The bill makes changes to existing law permitting a woman who received an abortion to bring a wrongful death action for her unborn child. The bill permits an action to be brought if the abortion was knowingly and purposely performed or induced (1) with the specific intent of causing or abetting the termination of the unborn human individual whose fetal heartbeat has been detected, or (2) without the woman's signature on an acknowledgement that the woman received the information (a) that there was a fetal heart beat and (b) about the statistical probability of the unborn human individual with a fetal heartbeat being brought to term. These circumstances for supporting the wrongful death action are in addition to those under continuing law regarding abortions done:

- Before determining the existence of a fetal heartbeat;
- Without notifying the woman that there was a fetal heartbeat and the statistical probability of the unborn human individual with a fetal heartbeat being brought to term; and
- Without informed consent required under R.C. 2317.56(B).<sup>31</sup>

---

<sup>29</sup> R.C. 2919.19(B)(2).

<sup>30</sup> R.C. 2919.19(B)(3).

<sup>31</sup> R.C. 2919.193(A), 2919.194(A), 2919.195(A), and 2919.199(A); and R.C. 2317.56(B).

## **Recovery of court costs and attorney's fees**

The bill requires the court to award the woman court costs and reasonable attorney's fees if she prevails in the action. This is in addition to damages as permitted under current law. But, if the defendant prevails, the bill requires the court to award reasonable attorney's fees to the defendant if both of the following apply:

- Commencement of the action was frivolous conduct and the defendant was adversely affected by it;
- The court's decision is not based on a finding that the law on which the action is based is unconstitutional.<sup>32</sup>

## **Unconstitutionality defense**

The bill provides that a court finding of unconstitutionality of the law under which the wrongful death action is brought shall be a defense to the action.<sup>33</sup>

## **Pregnant woman not liable**

The bill provides that a pregnant woman on whom an abortion is performed in violation of any of the following crimes is not guilty of the crimes or of attempting to commit, conspiring to commit, or complicity in committing the crimes:

(1) Performing or inducing an abortion before determining whether there is a fetal heartbeat;

(2) Performing or inducing an abortion after the detection of a fetal heartbeat; or

(3) Performing or inducing an abortion without informed consent when there is a detectable fetal heartbeat (in the situation in which the woman did not sign the acknowledgement form stating that the woman received the information (a) that there was a fetal heartbeat and (b) about the statistical probability of the unborn human individual with a fetal heartbeat being brought to term).

Further, the pregnant woman is not subject to a civil penalty based on the violations.<sup>34</sup>

---

<sup>32</sup> R.C. 2919.199(B) and (D).

<sup>33</sup> R.C. 2919.199(C).

<sup>34</sup> R.C. 2919.198.

## **Intent of General Assembly regarding adoption information**

The bill states that it is the General Assembly's intent that women whose pregnancies are protected under the bill to be informed of available options for adoption.<sup>35</sup>

## **Joint Legislative Committee on Adoption Promotion and Support**

The bill creates the Joint Legislative Committee on Adoption Promotion and Support to further the General Assembly's intent to inform women whose pregnancies are protected under the bill of adoption options. The bill permits the Committee to review or study any matter that it considers relevant to the adoption process in Ohio, with priority given to the study or review of mechanisms intended to increase awareness of the process, increase its effectiveness, or both. The bill grants the Committee the same powers as other standing or select committees of the General Assembly.<sup>36</sup>

### **Committee membership**

The committee is to consist of three members of the House of Representatives appointed by the Speaker of the House and three members of the Senate appointed by the Senate President. Not more than two members appointed by the Speaker and not more than two members appointed by the President may be of the same political party.<sup>37</sup>

### **Terms of office**

Each member of the Committee is to hold office during the general assembly in which the member is appointed and until a successor has been appointed, notwithstanding the adjournment sine die of the general assembly in which the member was appointed or the expiration of the member's term as a member of the general assembly.<sup>38</sup>

---

<sup>35</sup> R.C. 2919.1910(A).

<sup>36</sup> R.C. 2919.1910(B) and (D).

<sup>37</sup> R.C. 2910.1919(C).

<sup>38</sup> R.C. 2910.1919(C).



## **Filling of vacancies**

The bill requires any vacancies occurring among the members of the Committee to be filled in the manner of the original appointment.<sup>39</sup>

## **Background: current Ohio law regarding abortion**

### **Determination of fetal heartbeat before an abortion**

Ohio law requires a person who intends to perform or induce an abortion on a pregnant woman to determine whether there is a detectable fetal heartbeat of the unborn human individual the pregnant woman is carrying.<sup>40</sup> The method of determining the presence of a fetal heartbeat must be consistent with the person's good faith understanding of standard medical practice.

The Director of Health may establish rules specifying the appropriate methods of performing an examination to determine a fetal heartbeat based on standard medical practice; the rules must require the examination to be performed externally.<sup>41</sup> The person who performs the examination for the presence of a fetal heartbeat must give the pregnant woman the option to view or hear the fetal heartbeat.<sup>42</sup>

### **Abortion procedure in case of fetal heartbeat**

Current law permits abortions after a fetal heartbeat has been detected, prior to viability.<sup>43</sup> "Viable" is defined as the stage of development of a human fetus at which in the determination of a physician, based on the particular facts of a woman's pregnancy that are known to the physician and in light of medical technology and information reasonably available to the physician, there is a realistic possibility of the maintaining and nourishing of a life outside of the womb with or without temporary artificial life-sustaining support.<sup>44</sup> The bill does not amend the viability provisions of the law.

Continuing law requires the person intending to perform or induce the abortion to inform the pregnant woman if there is a fetal heartbeat and of the statistical probability of bringing the unborn human individual, for which the fetal heartbeat was

---

<sup>39</sup> R.C. 2910.1919(C).

<sup>40</sup> R.C. 2919.192 (renumbered from 2919.191 under the bill).

<sup>41</sup> R.C. 2919.192(B).

<sup>42</sup> R.C. 2919.192(A).

<sup>43</sup> R.C. 2919.194 (renumbered from R.C. 2919.192 under the bill); R.C. 2919.17(A), not in the bill.

<sup>44</sup> R.C. 2919.16(M), not in the bill.



detected, to term.<sup>45</sup> After satisfying the informed consent requirements, the person would also need to wait at least 24 hours before performing or inducing the abortion.<sup>46</sup> These provisions do not apply when a physician believes that a medical emergency exists.<sup>47</sup>

---

## COMMENT

1. In 1973, the United States Supreme Court held in *Roe v. Wade*<sup>48</sup> that certain bans on abortion are unconstitutional. The Court held that the right of personal privacy includes the right to terminate a pregnancy, subject to the state's interests in protecting the life and health of a pregnant woman and the developing embryo or fetus. The Court in *Roe* generally held that during the first trimester of pregnancy, states cannot impede a woman's right to obtain an abortion. During the second trimester, the state's interest in protecting the woman's health becomes more pressing because the risks associated with abortion are higher. Therefore, the Court stated that a state may regulate abortion "to the extent that the regulation reasonably relates to the preservation and protection of maternal health."<sup>49</sup> Finally, the Court stated that at the point of fetal viability, the beginning of the third trimester as determined by the Court, the state's interest in potential life of the fetus is sufficiently compelling to restrict or prohibit abortion.<sup>50</sup> The Court cautioned, however, that a state may not proscribe abortion at any point when abortion is necessary to preserve the life or health of the mother.<sup>51</sup>

Subsequent cases provided further guidance to the states as to how and when abortions may be regulated.<sup>52</sup> In *Planned Parenthood of Southeastern Pa. v. Casey*,<sup>53</sup> the Court reaffirmed what it termed *Roe's* three-part "essential holding." First, a woman has the right to choose to have an abortion before fetal viability and to obtain it without

---

<sup>45</sup> R.C. 2919.194(A)(1) and (2).

<sup>46</sup> R.C. 2919.194(A).

<sup>47</sup> R.C. 2919.194(B).

<sup>48</sup> 410 U.S. 113, 154 (1973).

<sup>49</sup> 410 U.S. at 163.

<sup>50</sup> 410 U.S. at 163-164.

<sup>51</sup> 410 U.S. at 163-164.

<sup>52</sup> See *Planned Parenthood of Southeastern Pa. v. Casey*, 505 U.S. 833 (1992), *Stenberg v. Carhart*, 530 U.S. 914 (2000), and *Gonzales v. Carhart*, 550 U.S. 124 (2007).

<sup>53</sup> 505 U.S. 833 (1992).

undue interference from the State. Second, the State has the power to restrict abortions after viability, if the law contains exceptions for pregnancies endangering the woman's life or health. And third, the State has legitimate interests from the pregnancy's outset in protecting the health of the woman and the life of the fetus that may become a child.<sup>54</sup> In *Stenberg v. Carhart*,<sup>55</sup> the Court struck down a Nebraska law that criminalized the performance of partial-birth abortions because it lacked an exception to protect the health of the pregnant woman and because it could be interpreted to prohibit a more common abortion procedure, thus placing an undue burden on a woman's right to obtain an abortion. In *Gonzales v. Carhart*,<sup>56</sup> the Court upheld the Partial-Birth Abortion Ban Act of 2003.<sup>57</sup> The Act banned a specific type of partial birth abortion, the intact dilation and evacuation. The Court found that "[w]here it has a rational basis to act, and it does not impose an undue burden, the State may use its regulatory power to bar certain procedures and substitute others, all in furtherance of its legitimate interests in regulating the medical profession in order to promote respect for life, including life of the unborn."<sup>58</sup>

2. Article III of the U.S. Constitution limits the jurisdiction of federal courts to "cases" and "controversies."<sup>59</sup> Absent any case or controversy, federal courts have no authority to issue advisory opinions that declare the constitutionality of a law.<sup>60</sup> The Ohio Constitution has a similar requirement. Ohio courts require litigants to show that they have suffered an injury that is traceable to the defendant's allegedly unlawful conduct, which is likely to be redressed by the requested relief.<sup>61</sup> It is unclear whether the Attorney General or county prosecutors applying to federal or state courts for a declaration that Ohio law is constitutional, as provided in the bill, would involve a case or controversy.

---

<sup>54</sup> 505 U.S. at 846.

<sup>55</sup> 530 U.S. 914 (2000).

<sup>56</sup> 550 U.S. 124 (2007).

<sup>57</sup> 18 U.S.C. § 1531.

<sup>58</sup> 550 U.S. at 158.

<sup>59</sup> U.S. Const., Art. III, § 2.

<sup>60</sup> See *Veith v. Jubelirer*, 541 U.S. 267, 302 (2004) (Justice Scalia, writing for the court, provides a history of refusing to issue advisory opinions, beginning in 1793).

<sup>61</sup> *Progressohio.org, Inc. v. Jobsohio*, 139 Ohio St.3d 520, 521 (2014) (interpreting Art. IV, Ohio Const.).



---

## HISTORY

ACTION

DATE

Introduced

02-17-15

H0069-I-131.docx/emr

